



# Art Schaafsma et al. Neonicotinoid Treated Seed and Fugitive Dust

## Literature Review for AIB

Jill M.G. Chapleau Goss, Feed, Seed & Fertilizer Specialist

Vermont Agency of Agriculture, Food & Markets



# “Planter Modification Can Fix Neonic Problem, says University of Guelph Researcher”

Real Agriculture post on YouTube.com:  
<https://youtu.be/AhnBIR9Oyew>

## Dust-off is primarily a “machinery problem”

Industry has two ways to mitigate liberated dust coming from the planters:

1. First, air could be cleaned as it is sucked into the machine.
2. Second it could be cleaned as it is exhausted from the machine. Or a combination of these two processes could be applied.

These solutions could eliminate over 95% of the fugitive dust

- Once in the ground seed treatments are shown to stay relatively close to the site it is planted in.
- Fugitive dust is subject to being redistributed.
- Dr. Schaafsma’s experiments (traditional seed lubricants vs. Bayer Crop Science’s Fluency agent) demonstrated Bayer product added greater than 95% efficiency in the lab yet only a 60% efficiency in the field. Disparity believed to be due to the use of vacuum seeders.

**RE: retrofit deflector units applied in Europe do slow down air intake, do not release the fugitive dust into the air → deposit it back onto the soil surface → redistribution potential!**

**“Planter Modification  
Can Fix Neonic  
Problem, says  
University of Guelph  
Researcher”**

Real Agriculture post on YouTube.com:  
<https://youtu.be/AhnBIR9Oyew>

Some ideas put forth by Dr. Schaafsma for consideration by the seed and equipment manufacturers include:

- Making seed coatings more abrasive resistant.
- Adding an additional coating to make applied coatings more abrasive resistant.
- Using filters on intake and exhaust air of vacuum planters.
- Use cyclone machines to clean exhaust air prior to release into the atmosphere.
- Applying dust off with use of a coulter planter.

# Field Crop News: “Neonicotinoid Contaminated Dust and Pollinator Exposure during Planting; Results from 2013”

<https://fieldcropnews.com/2014/01/neonicotinoid-contaminated-dust-and-pollinator-exposure-during-planting-results-from-2013/>

Corn Dust Research Consortium (CDRC) study April of 2013 to late June of 2013 purposes of determining:

- “available flowering resources around corn during planting”
- to evaluate the efficacy of Bayer Fluency Agent in “reducing neonicotinoid contaminated dust from vacuum planter manifolds.”
- Additional cooperative investigation to determine other potential routes for exposures for pollinators.

Nine paired fields planted conventional lubricant vs Bayer Fluency®.

Pre-study monitoring conducted within a range of 2-3 km of the study fields and continued weekly from planting → week 6 (collected pollen and dead bees for identification and residue analysis.

Weekly scouting around the field sites and at the beehives conducted to evaluate pollen available.

# Field Crop News: “Neonicotinoid Contaminated Dust and Pollinator Exposure during Planting; Results from 2013”

<https://fieldcropnews.com/2014/01/neonicotinoid-contaminated-dust-and-pollinator-exposure-during-planting-results-from-2013/>

Scouting determined foraging resources available to pollinators: willows, maples, and members of the Rosaceae family (hawthorn, apples etc) with dandelions being only a small portion collected by the study.

## Findings:

- Pollen resources reflect those identified by researchers at both Ohio State University and Iowa State University
- Neonicotinoid dust is emitted from negative vacuum planters through their exhaust manifolds and was captured by the researchers both directly at the manifold and at dust towers located 2 metres above ground downwind of the corn planting “...suggesting that dust leaves the field via wind drift, landing on flowering resources off-site.”
- Researchers found a 28% reduction in neonicotinoid ingredient in the planter exhaust when using the Bayer Fluency
- Correlation established between neonicotinoid dust escaping from the planter and downwind levels on dandelions suggesting that “planters have a direct effect on what is found in/on the flowering resources downwind.”
- There may be other routes of neonicotinoid residue exposure such as “standing water, in the soil at field surface (top 5 cm), in the dry soil dust layer stirred up by the movement of planter equipment through the field and in virgin corn pollen at tasseling.” All these alternate routes of exposure captured neonicotinoid residues yet all at “several orders of magnitude lower than those found escaping the planter manifolds...”

Researchers conclude all efforts be made to reduce the amount of dust, Bayer Fluency lubricant may be beneficial in combination with other best practice measures: planting of fungicide only seeds in fields that are low risk, using deflectors on manifold covers to deflect dust down to the ground to reduce contamination of off-target flowering resources.

PMRA/OMAF and MRA’s Best Management Practices for Pollinator Protection and Responsible Use of Insecticide Seed Treatment.

# Field Crop News: “What Growers Can Do to Mitigate Dust Drift at Planting”

<https://fieldcropnews.com/2016/04/what-growers-can-do-to-mitigate-dust-drift-at-planting/>

Use fluency agent to reduce dust (not graphite or talc)

Adapt equipment to direct exhaust air from the planter fan downward to the ground.

Alert beekeepers in your area prior to planting to allow them time to relocate hives.

Adapt conservation tillage practices to limit loss of soils which can contain neonicotinoid residues.

Follow IPM, using treated seed only when indicated.

Control blooming weeds prior to planting with treated seed to reduce pollinator’s attraction to the fields.

Future additional steps may include use of polymers to place a final seed coat and filtering air taken in by seed planters to eliminate abrasive dust from entering in to prevent treatments from being abraded and creating fugitive dust.

**Environmental  
Science &  
Technology**  
**“Quantifying  
Neonicotinoid  
Insecticide  
Residues Escaping  
during Maize  
Planting with  
Vacuum Planters”**

<https://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/acs.est.5b03753>

**Pneumatic planters + near universal use of neonicotinoid treated maize seed + concerns about acute bee mortality → role use of pneumatic planters has in neonicotinoid contaminated exhaust emitted during the planting process?**

Researchers noted the following:

- German study reported average emissions from pneumatic planters with imidacloprid-treated seeds were around 4% of the applied dose, 3-4 g of active ingredient(a.i.)/ha.
- Italian study reported ranges of 0.43-1.53 g/ha or 0.52-1.85% of the seed treatment applied to maize.

In North America talc/graphite utilized to lubricate seed as it moves through planting equipment but also acts as an abrasive when in contact with treated seed liberating some of the treatment applied.

Possible routes of release:

- The seed planting process.
- The routine cleaning of equipment.
- Dry and windy planting conditions may enhance spread of fugitive dust.

**A decrease of the planter’s fan airflow of “30% may reduce dust emission by more than 80%.”**



- 2013 Nine Ontario co-operators enrolled, 2 commercial maize fields each = 18 fields
- 2014 Original co-operators where possible retained + new participants added due to mandated crop rotation = 10 maize fields enrolled.
- Planting day pre-planting random soil sampling → 10 subsamples per field.
- Pre-planting soil dust samples collected via UTV with modified planter unit in tow moving through each field at planting speed (8-9 km/h) moving 500 m upwind.
- For maize planter exhaust dust virgin vacuum cleaner filter bags were sealed over the outlet of the planter's exhaust manifold and the planter made two complete passes (standardized to 100 m distance for a single planter row)
- 18 fields were sampled (with data from 2 fields removed due to “unexpected complications, which may have affected dust collection”) in 2013.
- 10 fields were sampled in 2014.
- Dust sticky trap towers placed on three 2 m high poles at 0 m in downwind direction from the planter oriented into the wind @ 3/field. Time standardized to a width of 150 m of planting perpendicular to the direction of the wind.
- Samples were analyzed for clothianidin, thiamethoxam and atrazine.

## Environmental Science & Technology “Quantifying Neonicotinoid Insecticide Residues Escaping during Maize Planting with Vacuum Planters”

<https://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/acs.est.5b03753>



# Environmental Science & Technology “Quantifying Neonicotinoid Insecticide Residues Escaping during Maize Planting with Vacuum Planters”

<https://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/acs.est.5b03753>

Neonicotinoid residues in dust generated by planting maize with pneumatic planters:

**On average loss of 0.0593 g/ha, 95.8% seed treatment residues + 4.2% from soil disturbance = approximately 0.21% of the treatment rate**

**\* 2014 mean recovery of 0.437% of seed applied neonicotinoids via the exhaust filter bag\***

\* = Previous study (Schnier et al.) reported recovering 10-fold more through a commercial car air filter. Perhaps due to: “ seed and seed treatment characteristics, planter design and scale, planter operational characteristics” but that the “planters, seed treatments and lubricants used in the commercial fields that we sampled represented the mainstream maize production in the Great Lakes Region of the North American maize belt.”

# Environmental Science & Technology “Quantifying Neonicotinoid Insecticide Residues Escaping during Maize Planting with Vacuum Planters”

<https://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/acs.est.5b03753>

**0.1104 g/ha of neonicotinoid residue collected by the trap towers likely represents mainly larger particles with the bulk of the remaining 0.0029 g/ha fugitive dust having potential for “long distance movement”**

***Total neonicotinoid residues in the dust plume during planting averages approximately  $0.1 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$   
> previous reports of in exhaust 5 m from the outlet of the planter fan ( $4.2\text{-}28.4 \text{ ng}/\text{m}^3$ )  
= $0.0042 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  to  $0.0284 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$***

**\*Research determined 95% of the neonicotinoid residues released during planting with pneumatic planters came directly from the seeds themselves while the remainder from the disturbed field soils.\***

Need to mitigate release of neonicotinoid fugitive dust from:

- Soil dust containing neonicotinoid residues from previous applications entering the intake of the vacuum planter.
- Dry dust entering the intake causing abrasion of the seed-coating.
- Added talc causing abrading the seed-coating.

Environmental  
Science &  
Technology  
“Quantifying  
Neonicotinoid  
Insecticide Residues  
Escaping during  
Maize Planting with  
Vacuum Planters”

<https://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/acs.est.5b03753>

Researchers recommend reducing the dust generated by planting through the following steps:

1. Develop seed coatings to improve adherence of active ingredient to treated seed
2. reducing abrasion from talc or from surface dust entering the vacuum air stream
3. removing active ingredient from planter exhaust
4. adopting conservation tillage practices to reduce surface soil disturbance before, during, and after planting...

**...”results unequivocally show that well over 95% of the exposure to non-target organisms for neonicotinoid insecticide seed treatment use originates from the exhaust during planting...”**

# ***Pest Management Science: “The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters”***

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

When testing a seed lubricant for Bayer Crop Science Dr. Schaafsma observed that when in the field levels of fugitive contaminated dust were greater than those observed in laboratory testing. This led to the hypothesis that field dust enters the air intakes of vacuum-style seed planters abrades the pesticide treatments and releases them via their exhaust.

Noted by researchers:

- Nuyttens et al. use of deflectors to reduce wind speed and redirect exhaust emissions from the planters to the soil and this method may reduce off-site drift by 30-70% yet pesticide residues deposited on the soil surface may be subject to redistribution still leading to potential pollinator exposure.
- Manzone et al. use of a cyclone apparatus to remove the pesticide residues from the exhaust prior to discharge, applying them into a soil furrow raising levels of reduction to nearly 100% recapture. Drawback: “cyclones are capital intensive”.
- Biocca et al. a “less capital intensive” option: use of a filtering recirculating system produces a near 85% efficacy in reducing fugitive dust emission. Drawbacks: need for “...filter replacement and potential disposal restrictions of spent cartridges.”

**Earlier research focused on treatment dust emanating from seed-to-seed contact. Dr. Schaafsma’s belief is that abrasion of seed is “enhanced” with exposure to field dust entering planters or the use of traditional seed lubricants such as talc.**

***Pest Management Science: “The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters”***

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

“The objectives of this study were:

1. to characterize the role of field dust in the escape of pesticide-contaminated exhaust from vacuum planters,
2. to quantify the amount of dust involved in this contamination,
3. to determine what extent the dust could be practically mitigated and
4. to determine whether the addition of surrogate dust to the ESA Heubach protocol could increase the resolution of testing anti-abrasive properties of seed coatings.”

# **Pest Management Science: “The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters”**

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

## **Field study:**

- An eight-row pull-type planter was used (3500 Twin-Line; Kinze)
- A pneumatic seed metering system (7100-456 EdgeVac, Kinze Manufacturing) calibrated to 76 200 seeds ha<sup>-1</sup> @ 17.3 cm spacing between plants @ travel speed of 8 km h<sup>-1</sup>
- 2014 seven fields selected (loam, sandy loam, and clay loam soils). Various tillage methods (conservation, no-till and conventional).
- 2015 and 2016 one extra conventional clay loam field used for each year.
- “The same seed lot was planted at all locations” Maizex 4030 (1000 seed weight of 200g)

### **Treatments applied to all seed as follows:**

**0.25 mg/kernel clothianidin (Poncho 250<sup>®</sup>)**  
**0.007 mg/kernel mefenoxam (Maxim XL<sup>®</sup>)**  
**0.002 mg/kernel azoxystrobin (Dynasty<sup>®</sup>)**  
**Seed finishing polymer/binder**

## **Lab study:**

- Selected the maximum measured amount of dust (0.5 g dust per 100 g of seeds at a rate of 75000 seed ha<sup>-1</sup> measured during the field portions of the study as the amount of dust surrogate used (diatomaceous earth).
- Utilized a stationary Kinze single unit standing planter.
- Employed the use of two variable speed motors. One to drive the seed metering device and the other to drive a cone-seeding device adapted to deliver the dust into the airstream at prescribed rate.

## **Heubach Dust Meter:**

- Utilized to evaluate the role of field dust on clothianidin quantities and concentrations.
- Two seed lots sourced tested and treated separately one feed corn and one seed corn.
- Used the same treatment protocol as above.

### **Seed lots then divided into equal batches and then treated with additional polymer ingredients:**

**Batch one, BASF Flo Rite 1197**

**Batch two, BASF product X**

**Batch three, used BASF product X both in the initial treatment slurry with the insecticides and fungicides and a second overcoat when initial treatment nearly dry.**

# ***Pest Management Science: “The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters”***

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

## **Dust Mitigation Field Experiment Collaborative Study:**

- Pre-dust mitigated portion of the study was part of a larger study on pollinator exposure to neonicotinoid seed treatments on maize through use of vacuum-style planters.
- 10 co-operators = 24 fields total planted in 2014-2015 with neonicotinoid treated seed.

### **During dust mitigated portion:**

- Planters had vacuum bags installed on all vents in the metering units, on hopper box lids, and tubing was sealed.
- Air drawn into planter via a special pipe drawing “relatively” clean air from ~ 4 m above the equipment through an added filter.
- Seeds used were dressed in the additional polymer coating and Bayer Fluency® product was used at label recommended rate.

## **Air Sample Collection:**

- 2014-2016 agricultural fields were sampled for exiting particulate matter with active air samplers facing directly into the wind, results adjusted to ng/m<sup>3</sup>.



**Pest  
Management  
Science: “The  
role of field dust  
in pesticide drift  
when pesticide-  
treated maize  
seeds are  
planted with  
vacuum-type  
planters”**

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

- **“Field dust entering the vacuum System had a positive effect on the total amount of clothianidin captured in the filter bags.”** Mean amount of dust collected was  $46 \text{ g/ha}^{-1}$ , mean amount of clothianidin collected was  $0.77 \text{ g/ha}^{-1}$  = a linear relationship.
- Lab dust experiments, ~80% of added dust recovered by the exhaust filter. Total amount of clothianidin recovered increased linearly as the amount of dust introduced increased.
- Heubach dust meter experiments in the lab on the Flo Rite 1197 treated seed showed a **“strong positive and linear relationship between the amounts of fine dust (diatomaceous earth) added with the seeds and the amounts recovered in the filters.”**
  - Comparing seed lots and treatments in this experiment found no **“main or interactive effects attributable to seed lot. When seed lots and polymer treatments were compared using dust recovered as the parameter, for the treatments where no dust was added, the Heubach protocol showed no effect attributable to seed lot...polymer used...or their interaction.”**
  - There was **“an interaction between polymer treatment and dust added”** when product X was double applied **“slightly less dust was recovered”**.
  - Where dust was added into the Heubach protocol **“amount of clothianidin recovered increased with the amount of dust added into the system, but reached a maximum before it started to drop off as more dust was added. This response varied with treatment group and with seed lot. The maximum amount of clothianidin recovered ranged from 0.13 to 0.25 g per 100 seeds...Regardless of the seed lot used, product X applied twice resulted in the least amount of clothianidin lost. Product X applied alone resulted in less clothianidin lost than polymer 1197 applied alone.”**
- **Dust mitigation field experiments 2016 data compared with and without various mitigation strategies deployed, found when several mitigation strategies are utilized:**

**“The mean reduction in fugitive clothianidin achieved was approximately 98%.”**

# **Pest Management Science: “The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters”**

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

- *Field dust entering the vacuum planters is abrasive to seed treatments and increases the amount of the treatment lost via exhaust = ~12.6% of the active ingredient lost in the worse case scenario and ~2.6% as an average*
- Previous work by Xue et al. had recovered 0.004-0.671% difference is likely attributable to the following differences:
  - John Deere planters used in the first study utilize lower negative pressures, less air volume, lower air speed and do not lend themselves as readily to the tight seals when filter bags were applied. The Kinze planters higher power system may have promoted more seed abrasion as well as lent itself better for a tight seal with the vacuum bags employed for filtration; with rates of dust recovered greater than in the John Deere planters.
- *“Residues bound on soil from applications from previous years also contribute a portion (4.2%) to the exhaust.”*
- *“There were three cases of residue escapes exceeding 3g ha<sup>-1</sup> and one exceeding 4 g ha<sup>-1</sup>, suggesting that the amount of active ingredient escaping the vacuum planters is greater than originally believed, that it is proportional to the field dust entering the system, and that certain characteristics such as the type (e.g., soil texture) and availability (e.g., tillage and soil moisture) of dust may result in worse situations.”*

## ***Pest Management Science: “The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters”***

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

- “Similar results were obtained in the laboratory using a single stationary planting unit of similar design to that used in the field. The amount of dust recovered was 80% of that applied, with a good correlation between the two. It was observed that as the amount of dust entering the vacuum system increased, the concentration of clothianidin decreased, suggesting that a point of saturation might be reached in the system where adding more dust would make no difference to the result. This phenomenon was observed in the field, where the concentration of clothianidin declined logarithmically with the amount of dust recovered in the planter exhaust.”
- ***The Heubach dust meter is “accurate and precise under the conditions it was designed to operate, and for the measurements it was designed to take.” But the system “...underestimates the risk of contaminated dust drift...Vacuum system on the Heubach unit operates at a much lower negative pressure than what the seeds experience during planting in the hoppers and in the metering devices. What the Heubach also fails to account for is the abrasiveness of the air laden with field dust as it passes by the seed metering device.”***

***Pest Management  
Science: “The role of  
field dust in pesticide  
drift when pesticide-  
treated maize seeds are  
planted with vacuum-  
type planters”***

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

- Adding dust to the Heubach protocol differences between seed lots and polymer treatments were highly discriminable, whereas when the same treatments and seed lots were tested without dust, differences were much less discernible. A smaller proportion of dust was recovered relative to what was added using the Heubach method compared with the standard planting unit, and the Heubach system seemed more easily saturated with excess dust. Furthermore, the ratio of clothianidin recovered to dust added was also about half of that observed for the planting equipment experiments, suggesting that some efficiency improvements can be explored with the Heubach system.”
- “,,,in addition to the Heubach protocol which sets seed quality standards before seed is planted, adding a step with dust to set anti-abrasive seed quality standards during planting, to move the development of non-abrasive seed treatment polymers and treatment technology forward to address the problem of particulate pesticide drift during planting.”

# ***Pest Management Science: “The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters”***

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

**“...the goal of mitigating pesticide drift during planting with vacuum planters by >95% is realistic and achievable.** Our study was not designed to differentiate between the relative contributions of each of the mitigation strategies, **but it is our opinion that filtering the exhaust air in this study was the main contributing factor to the 98% reduction in fugitive clothianidin achieved.** Without the other factors deployed, the filter system, which served as the system backstop, would likely have been saturated. **We believe a combination of mitigation strategies must be deployed in tandem to achieve the goal of curtailing the pesticide drift during plant(*sic*) with modern corn planters.** These include: the use of better seed treatment polymers with some changes in how they are applied; sourcing clean air to operate the vacuum metering systems, and the scrubbing of vacuum exhaust through filtration or other mechanical means, ensuring that the residues are not left on the soil surface where they can be redistributed.”



**Any  
Questions?**





Art Schaafsma et al.  
Neonicotinoid Treated  
Seed and Fugitive Dust  
Reference Page

References

Baute, T. (2014, January 20). *Neonicotinoid Contaminated Dust and Pollinator Exposure during Planting; Results from 2013.*

Retrieved from <https://fieldcropnews.com/>: <https://fieldcropnews.com/2014/01/neonicotinoid-contaminated-dust-and-pollinator-exposure-during-planting-results-from-2013/>

Baute, T. (2016, April 26). *What Growers Can Do to Mitigate Dust Drift at Planting.*

Retrieved from Field Crop News: <https://fieldcropnews.com/2016/04/what-growers-can-do-to-mitigate-dust-drift-at-planting/>

*Pollinator Protection and Responsible Use of Treated Seed - Best Management Practices.* ( 2015, March 9). Retrieved from

Government of Canada:

<https://www.canada.ca/en/health-canada/services/consumer-product-safety/reports-publications/pesticides-pest-management/fact-sheets-other-resources/pollinator-treated-seed/best-management-practices.html>

Schaafsma, A. L.-R. (2017). The role of field dust in pesticide drift when pesticide-treated maize seeds are planted with vacuum-type planters. *Pest Management Science* 74, 323-331.

<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/ps.4696>

Schaafsma, D. A. (n.d.). Planter Modification Can Fix Neonic Problem, says University of Guelph Researcher. (B. Tobin, Interviewer)

<https://youtu.be/AhnBIR9Oyew>

Yingen Xue, V. L.-R. (2015, 49). Quantifying Neonicotinoid Insecticide Residues Escaping during Maize Planting with Vacuum Planters. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 13003-13011.

<https://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/acs.est.5b03753>